

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA  
No. 1:23-cv-00423-WO-JLW

TIMIA CHAPLIN; KEVIN SPRUILL; )  
ROTESHA MCNEIL; QIANA ROBERTSON; )  
YOUSEF JALLAL; MESSIEJAH BRADLEY; )  
PAULINO CASTELLANOS; ROBERT LEWIS; )  
AND ALLEN SIFFORD, on behalf of )  
themselves and all others similarly situated, )  
Plaintiffs, )  
v. )  
WILLIE R. ROWE, in his official capacity as the )  
Sheriff of Wake County; BRIAN ESTES, in his )  
official capacity as the Sheriff of Lee County; )  
THE OHIO CASUALTY INSURANCE )  
COMPANY, as the surety for the Sheriff of )  
Wake County and as surety for the Sheriff of Lee )  
County; TYLER TECHNOLOGIES, INC.; )  
NORTH CAROLINA ADMINISTRATIVE )  
OFFICE OF THE COURTS; RYAN BOYCE, in )  
his official capacity as the Executive Director of )  
the North Carolina Administrative Office of the )  
Courts; BRAD FOWLER, in his official capacity )  
as the eCourts Executive Sponsor and Chief )  
Business Officer of the North Carolina )  
Administrative Office of the Courts; BLAIR )  
WILLIAMS, in his official capacity as the Wake )  
County Clerk of Superior Court; SUSIE K. )  
THOMAS, in her official capacity as the Lee )  
County Clerk of Superior Court; JOHN DOE )  
SURETY, as the surety for the Wake County )  
Clerk of Superior Court and the Lee County )  
Clerk of Superior Court; and DOES 1 )  
THROUGH 20, INCLUSIVE, )  
Defendants. )

**RESPONSE IN  
OPPOSITION TO  
PLAINTIFFS' MOTION  
FOR CLASS  
CERTIFICATION OF  
DEFENDANT BRIAN  
ESTES,  
IN HIS OFFICIAL  
CAPACITY AS SHERIFF  
OF LEE COUNTY**

NOW COMES the Defendant Brian Estes, in his official capacity as Sheriff of Lee County, and files this response in opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification.

Defendant Estes opposes Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification (Doc. 53).

Defendant Estes incorporates by reference the arguments in the briefs and responses opposing Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification that have been filed, or will be filed, by the other defendants in this lawsuit.

WHEREFORE, Defendant Estes respectfully submits that his motion to dismiss should be granted, and that Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification should be denied.

Respectfully submitted, this the 5th day of January, 2024.

/s/ James R. Morgan, Jr.

James R. Morgan, Jr.  
N.C. State Bar No. 12496  
WOMBLE BOND DICKINSON (US) LLP  
One West Fourth Street  
Winston-Salem, NC 27101  
Telephone: (336) 721-3710  
Facsimile: (336) 733-8394  
E-mail: Jim.Morgan@wbd-us.com  
*Attorney for Defendant Brian Estes*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on January 5, 2023, I electronically filed the foregoing **RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION OF DEFENDANT BRIAN ESTES, IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS SHERIFF OF LEE COUNTY** with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of the filing to all Counsel of record.

/s/ James R. Morgan, Jr.  
James R. Morgan, Jr.  
N.C. State Bar No. 12496  
WOMBLE BOND DICKINSON (US) LLP  
One West Fourth Street  
Winston-Salem, NC 27101  
Telephone: (336) 721-3710  
Facsimile: (336) 733-8394  
E-mail: Jim.Morgan@wbd-us.com  
*Attorney for Defendant Brian Estes*